Sex Bias in Research

UNC Institutional Review Board February 2019



Melina R. Kibbe, MD, FACS, FAHA

Colin G. Thomas Jr. Distinguished Professor and Chair, Department of Surgery Professor, Department of Biomedical Engineering University of North Carolina School of Medicine Staff Physician, Durham VAMC

Are These People Similar?







Are These People Similar?





Are These People Similar?









NO!



Why Do Researchers Study *Males* When Developing Therapies for *Both* Sexes?









Sex-Based Differences

- Men and women:
 - Manifest diseases differently
 - Experience illnesses differently
 - Respond to drugs differently
 - Metabolize drugs differently
 - Respond to devices differently



 Have different outcomes following medical and surgical therapies



Common Clinical Diseases with Sex and Gender Differences





Heart Association.

Incidence of Cardiovascular by Age and Sex



Framingham Heart Study, 1980–2003 Go A S et al. Circulation. 2014;129:e28-e292

Cardiovascular Disease Mortality Trends by Sex

F

Association_®



Go A S et al. Circulation. 2014;129:e28-e292

Sex-Based Differences for Cardiovascular Drugs

- Aspirin
 - More beneficial for men than women
- Statins
 - More beneficial in men for primary prevention
 - Greater risk of adverse reactions in women
- Angiotensin converting enzyme inhibitors
 - Cause more adverse effects in women
- Digoxin
 - Associated with increased mortality in women
- Warfarin
 - Women require lower doses than men

Why Are Men and Women Given the Same Drug?





Why are Men and Women Given the Same Dose of the Drug?





Can You Think of Any Drugs that Are Dosed Based on Sex?





A to Z Index | Follow FDA | En Español



EFFECT OF GENDER

A study to determine the effect of gender on zolpidem PK was submitted; however, background and study design was not included. Subjects were healthy males and females (age: 19-45).

RESULTS:

Table.	The m	ean PK p	arameters of	20 mg	zolpidem.
	И	Cmax (ng/ml)	AUC (ng/ml*hr)	tmax (hr)	half-life <u>(hr)</u>
Females Males	16 49	340 234	1264 859	1.1 2.0	2.7
COMMENT :	1				

Both Cmax and AUC were approximately 45% higher in females than males with tmax occurring 1 hour sooner in females. The results suggest a gender related difference; however, the lack of specific details such as study design and individual data make it difficult to draw a definite conclusion.

How Did We Get To This Point?

- Women have been poorly represented in clinical trials
- Sex-based differences have not been specifically sought out
- Sex-based differences are often not reported



The Revitalization Act of 1993

- Signed into law on June 10, 1993 in the US
- Requires that women and minorities be included as subjects in clinical research funded by the National Institutes of Health (NIH)



Where Are We At Now?

- Geller et al (2011)
 - Federally funded RCT published in 2009
 - 76% of RCT enrolled both men and women
 - Females represented only 37% of the enrollment
 - 64% of the studies did not specify their results by sex
- Clinical trials on statin use (2014)
 - 1990-2000 19% women enrolled
 - 2000-2010 31% women enrolled
- Hettrich et al (2015)
 - Showed an increase in sex-specific analysis from 19% to 30% from 2000 to 2010 in orthopedic literature

Farahani, 2014 Geller et al, J Womens Health 2011 Hettrich et al, Clin Ortho & Related Res 2015







- Goal
 - To determine if a sex bias exists in basic and translational surgery research
- Hypothesis
 - Sex bias exists in surgical biomedical research

Methods

- Evaluated ALL publications in 2011-2012 in:
 - Annals of Surgery
 - American Journal of Surgery
 - JAMA Surgery
 - Journal of Surgical Research
 - Surgery

Methods

- Variables abstracted:
 - **1.** Type of study (cells, animals, humans)
 - 2. First author name
 - 3. Title
 - **4.** Institution affiliation
 - 5. Single or multi-center study
 - 6. National or international
 - 7. Sex-specific disease (i.e., ovarian, testicular, etc.)
 - 8. Number of animals used
 - 9. Sex of the animals and/or cells
 - **10.** Presence of sex-based reporting

Sex Bias Exists with Animal Research

n=531 Yoon et al, Surgery 2014

Sex Bias Exists with Animal Research

Yoon et al, Surgery 2014

Sex Bias Exists with Cell Research

Yoon et al, Surgery 2014

Sex Bias Exists with Cell Research

Yoon et al, Surgery 2014

Does Sex Disparity Exist When Studying Diseases Prevalent in Females?

- Diseases prevalent in women:
 - Cardiovascular disease
 - Thyroid disease
 - Obesity
 - Depression
 - Cholelithiasis
 - Migraines
 - Irritable bowel syndrome
 - Multiple sclerosis
 - Rheumatoid arthritis

Does Sex Disparity Exist When Studying Diseases Prevalent in Females?

- 45 manuscripts:
 - 29 cardiovascular disease
 - 16 thyroid disease
- 44% did not specify the sex studied (n=20)

Has Sex Disparity in Surgical Research Improved or Worsened Over Time?

Yoon et al, Surgery 2014

Implications of Sex-Biased Research

- Drugs are developed that may be ineffective for women
- Drugs are developed that may have unidentified side effects in women
- Drugs that show no efficacy in men are not developed further
- Drugs that are studied in both sexes, but with aggregated data, may be more effective in one sex over the other

What About Human Clinical Research in Surgery?

Overall Assessment of the Manuscripts

Mansukhani et al, JAMA Surgery 2016

Inclusion of Both Males and Females

Surgical Research Does Not Match Inclusion of Males and Females Well

Mansukhani et al, JAMA Surgery 2016

GAO 2015 Report

- More females than males were included in NIHfunded clinical research
- But, despite the NIH Revitalization Act of 1993 and increased female enrollment in clinical trials, sex-based reporting and analysis of results remains an area of disparity

Drugs Removed From the Market

 80% of drugs have been removed from the U.S. market due to a greater risk of serious adverse reaction in women compared to men

Zopf et al, Euro J Clin Pharm 2008 Heinrich. US GAO-01-286R, 2001 Tharpe. J Midwif & Womens Health 2011

Adverse Effects of Drugs in Women

- The odds of an adverse drug reaction in women is 50% greater than in men
- Women are more likely to be hospitalized due to an adverse drug reaction

Zopf et al, Euro J Clin Pharm 2008 Heinrich. US GAO-01-286R, 2001 Tharpe. J Midwif & Womens Health 2011

Some Good News....

 We recently examined subsequent citations of the publications from our studies

Sex Inclusive Research Received More Citations

Sex-based reporting	 2.8 more citations 	Articles with better sex matching
		received an
Sex-based	• 3.5 more	increase of 1
analysis	citations	4.8% increase
anarysis		in percentage
Sex-based	• 2.6 more	(95% CI, 2.0%- 7.7%, P = .001)
disedssion	Citations	

How Do We Fix This Problem?

Increased Awareness

Increased Awareness

Increased Awareness

National Institutes of Health

- Announced plans for a new policy in May 2014
- To require investigators "to report their plans for the balance of male and female cells and animals in preclinical studies in all future applications"

Implementing Rigor and Transparency in NIH & AHRQ Research Grant Applications

Notice Number: NOT-OD-16-011

Key Dates Release Date: October 9, 2015

Related Announcements

NOT-OD-16-034 NOT-OD-16-011 NOT-OD-16-031 NOT-OD-16-012 NOT-OD-16-005 NOT-OD-16-004 NOT-OD-15-103 NOT-OD-15-102

Issued by

National Institutes of Health (NIH) Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ)

Purpose

This notice informs the biomedical research community of updates to application instructions and review language intended to enhance the reproducibility of research findings through increased scientific rigor and transparency. These updates will take effect for most* research grant applications (including small business and complex research grant applications) submitted for due dates on or after January 25, 2016. For research contracts, this policy will be effective for proposals received on/after January 25, 2016 and expected to result in contract awards in Fiscal Year 2017 and beyond.

Updates include:

- · Revisions to application guide instructions for preparing your research strategy attachment
- · Use of a new "Authentication of Key Biological and/or Chemical Resources" attachment
- · Additional rigor and transparency questions reviewers will be asked to consider when reviewing applications

These updates focus on four areas deemed important for enhancing rigor and transparency:

1) the scientific premise forming the basis of the proposed research,

- 2) rigorous experimental design for robust and unbiased results,
- 3) consideration of relevant biological variables, and
- 4) authentication of key biological and/or chemical resources.

The basic principles of rigor and transparency and the four areas of focus apply to the full spectrum of research, from basic to clinical. Investigators will need to consider how all four areas apply to their proposed research. Likewise, reviewers will assess whether these areas have been appropriately addressed by the applicant through revised language defining the peer review criteria.

NIH Study Sessions

- June 2016 first NIH study sections with the new requirements
- Consideration of sex as a variable is a score deriving factor in the approach!
- Example:
 - "We will attempt to use all male mice since the incidence of aneurysm development is higher in males (80% vs 50%)" –June 2016
 - "Since no known differences have been reported in graft hyperplasia by sex, we will study only males".
 –Feb 2017
 - "We will study male pigs" –June 2018

Publications

Sex bias exists in basic science and translational surgical research

Dustin Y. Yoon, MD, MS,^a Neel A. Mansukhani, MD,^a Vanessa C. Stubbs, MD,^a Irene B. Helenowski, PhD,^b Teresa K. Woodruff, PhD,^{c,d} and Melina R. Kibbe, MD,^{a,d} Chicago, IL

Background. Although the Revitalization Act was passed in 1993 to increase enrollment of women in clinical trials, there has been little focus on sex disparity in basic and translational research. We hypothesize that sex bias exists in surgical biomedical research.

Methods. Manuscripts from Annals of Surgery, American Journal of Surgery, JAMA Surgery, Journal of Surgical Research, and Surgery from 2011 to 2012 were reviewed. Data abstracted included study type, sex of the animal or cell studied, location, and presence of sex-based reporting of data.

Results. Of 2,347 articles reviewed, 618 included animals and/or cells. For animal research, 22% of the publications did not specify the sex of the animals. Of the reports that did specify the sex, 80% of publications included only males, 17% only females, and 3% both sexes. A greater disparity existed in the number of animals studied: 16,152 (84%) male and 3,173 (16%) female (P < .0001). For cell research, 76% of the publications did not specify the sex. Of the papers that did specify the sex, 71% of publications included only males, 21% only females, and 7% both sexes. Only 7 (1%) studies reported sex-based results. For publications on female-prevalent diseases, 44% did not report the sex studied. Of those reports that specified the sex, only 12% studied female animals. More international than national (ie, United States) publications studied only males (85% vs 71%, P = .004), whereas more national publications did not specify the sex (47% vs 20%, P < .0001). A subanalysis of a single journal showed that across three decades, the number of male-only studies and usage of male animals has become more disparate over time.

Conclusion. Sex bias, be it overt, inadvertent, situational, financial, or ignorant, exists in surgical biomedical research. Because biomedical research serves as the foundation for subsequent clinical research and medical decision-making, it is imperative that this disparity be addressed because conclusions derived from such studies may be specific to only one sex. (Surgery 2014;156:508-16.)

From the Departments of Surgery,^a Preventive Medicine,^b and Obstetrics and Gynecology,^c and Women's Health Research Institute,^d Northwestern University, Chicago, IL

QUESTIONE DI SALUTE

Meline

Quote rosa nelle ricerche mediche

scienze

Ouote rosa anche per le cellule utilizzate nella ricerca biomedica. Lo hanno annunciato i National Institutes of Health dopo il polverone sollevato da uno studio del centro Northwestern Medicine di Chicago, Il chirurgo vascolare Melina R. Kibbe ha analizzato, insieme alla collega Teresa Woodruff, oltre duemila articoli scientifici nel campo della chirurgia e della medicina di base scoprendo che non solo una grossa percentuale di pubblicazioni non specifica il sesso dei soggetti analizzati (il 76 per cento negli studi sulle cellule, il 22 per cento in quelli sugli animali), ma che, guando lo fa, nell'80 per cento dei casi si tratta di quello maschile. E questo avviene nonostante la scienza abbia dimostrato da tempo che gli animali metabolizzano i farmaci in modo diverso a seconda del sesso e che uomini e donne possono reagire diversamente alla stessa malattia o allo stesso tipo di cura. La reazione del Dipartimento della salute Usa è stata immediata: i National Institutes of Health esigeranno dai loro ricercatori lo studio di ambo i sessi nelle ricerche precliniche (quelle in cui non sono ancora

coinvolti soggetti umani). «Un provvedimento» ha detto Kibbe «in grado di migliorare sensibilmente la ricerca sulle terapie farmacologiche».

(giulia villoresi)

IL SOLARE INVISIBILE FUNZIONA GIÀ CON UN PROTOTIPO A CAPRI. MA IL PROGETTO È DIFFONDERLO IN TUTTA ITALIA

IL FOTOVOLTAICO SI TRAVESTE DA MURETTO **E SALVA IL PAESAGGIO**

di Alex Saragosa

-in dal suo esordio il foto-- voltaico è stato criticato per la sua bruttezza. In Italia soprattutto, dove il patrimonio architettonico e paesaggistico è sterminato, spesso i pannelli solari suscitano diffidenza. Ora però la tecnologia è riuscita, finalmente, a coniugare funzionalità ed estetica. Lo dimostra il caso della Dyaqua Art Studio, un laboratorio vicentino fondato da dopo aver inventato pietre luminose dall'aspetto di rocce, ma in realtà fatte di plastica translucida che si illusima grazie a deiled, nel 2010 ha avuto l'idea di creare pannelli fotovoltaici che, attraverso la copertura translucida incamerano la luce solare, ma imitano perfettamente l'aspetto di roccia, legno o tegole. E così è possibile installarli su costruzioni e in paesaggi di pregio. Nel maggio scorso un prototi-

po di «solare invisibile» - perfezionato grazie a studi Enea con il contributo di Lux Italia, Fiamm e Porta Costruzioni - è stato mimetizzato in un muretto di Capri, Giovanni Battista Quagliato, che, pestinginare il famoso pino che guarda i Faraglioni. Ora la Dyaqua Art Studio cerca installatori italiani disposti a promuovere coppi, travi e rocce fotovoltaiche in tutta Italia, così da portare l'e-

Il prototipo di pannello fotovolta invisibile, mimetizzato in un mu a Capri per illuminare il pino di Pu Tragara, con vista sui Faraglioni

nergia solare dove finora n aveva osato avventurarsi. Nel frattempo gli americ

hanno reso il fotovoltaico add tura invisibile. L'ingegner chard Lunt e suoi colleghi d Michigan State University ha realizzato un pannello solare sparente inserendo nella plas sostanze fluorescenti che tras mano i raggi Uv e infraross Sole in luce utile per la con sione fotovoltaica, convoglian la verso i bordi della lastra, d la aspettano strette celle so Le case del futuro, quindi, tranno produrre elettricità n solo da muri e tegole, ma am da finestre e vetrate.

NUMERO VERDE **Cristina Mochi**

Sono i turisti (di 119 Raesi) che sono andati a fare whole wotching nel 2008 (ultimo anno per il quale sono disponibili dati): un business stimato in 2,1 miliardi di dollari. Nel 1991 erano stati 4 milioni, in 31 Paese l'osservazione di balene e delfini a bordo di barche, se praticata su larga scala, potrebbe pero nettere in pericolo i cetacei, sia per lo stress che provoca negli animali sia per le ferite che possono riportare dalle collisioni con le imbarcazioni. Lo dice l'Imcc di Glasgow (International Marine Conservation Congress). Una soluzione potrebbe venil dall'imporre più regole a quello che fin qui è stato considerato un turismo ecologico: si possor stabilire per esempio distanze minime da rispettare tra barche e animali, limiti di velocità e an interdette. Ma anche questo non sembra sufficiente: a Bocas del Toro, Panama, dove queste regole esistono, tra 2012 e 2013 sono morti almeno dieci delfini in una popolazione di circa 250

Journals

- Should require all authors to provide a description of the sex studied for cell, animal and human research
- If only one sex is studied, justification of a single-sex model should be required
- Would like ALL journals to require this

Surgery Journal Editors Group (SJEG)

Joint Statement by the Surgery Journal Editors Group*

We, the editors of surgery journals, believe that conducting sex-inclusive biomedical and clinical research is imperative to improving health outcomes of men and women. Note that the word "sex" is being used rather than "gender". Sex is the genotype by which one is born and gender is the phenotype. It is the chromosomal sex of the human, animal, tissue, or cell to which we are referring. Recent studies have shown that the majority of biomedical research in the field of surgery and related topics is conducted on male animals and male cells, even when studying diseases prevalent in women.¹ Human clinical research suffers from a lack of sex-based reporting and sexbased analysis of the results.^{2,3} Given these findings, the National Institutes of Health has now asked that sex be considered as a biologic variable in all National Institutes of Health-funded research.⁴ As such, we support uniform, defined reporting of the sex used for human, animal, tissue, and cell research in ALL manuscripts published in our journals. If only one sex is studied, authors must include a justification statement as to why a single-sex study was conducted. We also will require sex-based reporting and analysis of data for all human, animal, tissue, and cell research. As a group, we will require this among all our collective surgery journals.

*The Surgery Journal Editors Group is comprised of editors from 74 international, surgery-related journals who meet once a year at the annual meeting of the American College of Surgeons and discuss concerns common among surgery journals.

Food & Drug Administration (FDA)

- Should require ALL New Drug Applications to include the study of both sexes AND provide sex-based reporting of the data
- Should require ALL clinical trials to balance enrollment of men and women, AND conduct sex-based reporting of the data

FDA Report

FDA ACTION PLAN TO ENHANCE THE COLLECTION AND AVAILABILITY OF DEMOGRAPHIC SUBGROUP DATA

August 2014

Industry Funded Research

- Currently, there is no mandate or policy for industry sponsored clinical trials.
- The same guidelines that apply to government funded research and clinical trials should apply to industry sponsored clinical trials, given that these represent the majority (~90%) of clinical trials

Government

- Congressman Jim Cooper has proposed a new bill: "Research for All Act of 2015"
- Requirements for both the FDA and NIH

All Bill Information (Except Text) Cosponsors: H.R.2101 — 114th Congress (2015-2016) Sponsor: Rep. Cooper, Jim [D-TN-5] | Cosponsor statistics: 10 current - includes 1 original V Hide Facets Sort by First to Last * = Original cosponsor \wedge Date Cosponsored Cosponsor — Party Rep. Lummis, Cynthia M. [R-WY-At Large]* 04/29/2015 Check all Democratic [9] Rep. Lofgren, Zoe [D-CA-19] 07/28/2015 Republican [1] Rep. DeLauro, Rosa L. [D-CT-3] 07/29/2015 — Cosponsors by U.S. State or Rep. Schakowsky, Janice D. [D-IL-9] 11/18/2015 Territory New York [4] Rep. Waters, Maxine [D-CA-43] 11/18/2015 California [2] Rep. Jeffries, Hakeem S. [D-NY-8] 11/18/2015 [2] Connecticut [1] Illinois Rep. Nadler, Jerrold [D-NY-10] 12/09/2015 Wyoming [1] Rep. Himes, James A. [D-CT-4] 05/13/2016 Rep. Rice, Kathleen M. [D-NY-4] 09/06/2016 Rep. Velazquez, Nydia M. [D-NY-7] 09/06/2016

CONGRESS.GOV

Summary

- Sex matters!
- Research is fraught with sex bias
- Of manuscripts that stated the sex of the animal or cell studied, 80% studied only males
- Human surgical research needs better inclusion of both sexes, and data should be reported and analyzed by sex
- Great need for increased awareness
- Need for policy changes

